



CASES AND MATERIALS ON TRUSTS

VOLUME ONE: EXPRESS TRUSTS AND CHARITIES

1990 - 1991

v. 1

Professor R. Scane  
Professor J. Phillips  
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Compiled with the assistance of Lesley Midzain. These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.

Storage

17

737

178

1770

213

LAW LIBRARY

AUG 29 1990

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

CASES AND MATERIALS ON TRUSTS

VOLUME ONE: EXPRESS TRUSTS AND CHARITIES

1990 - 1991

Professor R. Scane  
Professor J. Phillips  
Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Compiled with the assistance of Lesley Midzain. These materials are reproduced solely for the use of students at the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

## TABLE OF CONTENTS: VOLUME I

### PART I - THE DEVELOPMENT AND NATURE OF THE TRUST

#### CHAPTER 1 - HISTORICAL INTRODUCTION

##### a. The Origins and Development of the Use

Statute of Uses, R.S.O. 1980, Appendix A.....	1
D. Brown, 'Historical Perspectives on the Statute of Uses', (1979) 9 Manitoba Law Journal 409.....	2
A.W .B. Simpson, <u>An Introduction to the History of the Land Law</u> .....	11

##### b. The Law of Trusts, 1700 to the Present

C. Backhouse, 'Married Women's Property Law in Nineteenth Century Canada', (1988) 6 Law and History Review 211.....	19
M.R. Chesterman, "Family Settlements on Trust: Landowners and the Rising Bourgeoisie", in D. Sugarman and G. Rubin, eds., <u>Law, Economy and Society, 1750-1914: Essays in the History of English Law</u> .....	21
G. Alexander, 'The Transformation of Trusts as a Legal Category, 1800-1914', (1987) 5 Law and History Review 303.....	24

#### CHAPTER 2 - THE TRUST COMPARED TO OTHER LEGAL RELATIONSHIPS - DEBT, BAILMENT, CONTRACT

##### a. Trust and Debt

Hydro Electric Power Commission of Ontario v. Brown (1959), 21 D.L.R. (2d) 551 (Ont. C.A.).....	35
Re Century 21 Brenmore Real Estate Ltd. (1980), 111 D.L.R. (3rd) 280 (Ont. C.A.).....	38

Queen in Right of British Columbia v. Henfrey Samson Belair Ltd.

(1989), 59 D.L.R. (4th) 726 (S.C.C.).....	44
b. <u>Trust and Contract</u>	
In Re Schebsman, [1944] Ch. 83 (C.A.).....	56
Tobin Tractor 1957 Ltd. v. Western Surety Co. (1963), 40 D.L.R. (2d) 231 (Sask. QB).....	66
c. <u>Trust and Agency</u>	
Trident Holdings Ltd. v. Danand Investments Ltd. et al (1988), 64 O.R. (2d) 65 (C.A.).....	75
 <u>CHAPTER 3 - THE TRUST COMPARED TO OTHER LEGAL RELATIONSHIPS - EQUITABLE CHARGE AND POWER OF APPOINTMENT</u>	
a. <u>Equitable Charge</u>	
Re Oliver (1890), 62 L.T. 533 (Ch.).....	82
In Re West, [1900] 1 Ch. 84.....	83
In Re Foord, [1922] 2 Ch. 519.....	86
b. <u>Power of Appointment</u>	
Re Weekes' Settlement, [1897] 1 Ch. 289.....	89
Re Lloyd, [1938] 1 D.L.R. 450 (Ont. H.C.).....	93

## PART II - THE EXPRESS TRUST

### CHAPTER 4 - CERTAINTY OF OBLIGATION AND CERTAINTY OF SUBJECT MATTER

#### a. The Three Certainties Generally

Knight v. Knight (1840), 49 E.R. 58 (Ch.).....	97
--	----

#### b. Certainty of Intention to Create a Trust

Johnson v. Farney (1913), 29 O.L.R. 233 (C.A.).....	102
Hayman v. Nicoll, [1944] S.C.R. 253.....	105

#### c. Certainty of Subject Matter - Generally

Palmer v. Simmons (1854), 61 E.R. 704 (Ch.).....	112
Re Beardmore Trusts, [1952] 1 D.L.R. 41 (Ont. H.C.).....	113
Re Walker (1925), 56 O.L.R. 517 (C.A.).....	118
Re Hornell, [1945] O.R. 58 (C.A.).....	120
Re Shamas, [1967] 2 O.R. 275 (C.A.).....	126
Re Armstrong, unreported, S.C. Ont., 22 May 1985.....	130

#### d. Certainty of Subject Matter - Quantum per Beneficiary

Re Golay's Will Trusts, [1965] 1 W.L.R. 969 (Ch.).....	139
--	-----

### CHAPTER 5 - CERTAINTY OF BENEFICIARIES - GENERAL

#### a. Conceptual Uncertainty

Re Coates, [1955] Ch. 495.....	141
Re Connor (1970), 10 D.L.R. (3d) 5 (Alta. C.A.).....	143
Re Baden's Deed Trusts (No. 2), [1973] 1 Ch. 9 (C.A.).....	146

#### b. Evidentiary Uncertainty and Administrative Unworkability: Powers and Trusts Distinguished



Re Gestetner Settlement, [1953] Ch. 672.....	150
Inland Revenue Commissioners v. Broadway Cottages Trust, [1955] Ch. 20 (C.A.).....	155
Re Gulbenkian's Settlement Trusts, [1970] A.C. 508 (H.L.)....	165
McPhail v. Doulton, [1971] A.C. 424 (H.L.).....	169
Re Baden's Deed Trusts (No. 2), [1973] 1 Ch. 9 (C.A.).....	178

## CHAPTER 6 - CERTAINTY OF BENEFICIARIES - THE PROBLEM OF NON-CHARITABLE PURPOSE TRUSTS

### a. The General Rule Against Validity

Re Astor's Settlement Trusts, [1952] Ch. 534.....	185
---	-----

### b. The Modern Trend Towards Validity

Re Denley's Trusts, [1969] 1 Ch. 373.....	193
In Re Recher's Will Trusts, [1972] 1 Ch. 526.....	196
In Re Lipinski's Will Trusts, [1976] 1 Ch. 235.....	200

### c. Statutory Reform

Perpetuities Act, R.S.O. 1980, c. 374.....	206
<u>Wood and Whitebread v. The Queen in Right of Alberta,</u> [1977] 6 W.W.R. 273 (Alta. S.C.).....	206
O.L.R.C., "Draft Trustee Act", s. 82.....	212



## CHAPTER 7 - THE CONSTITUTION OF THE TRUST

a.	<u>The Maxim that Equity will Not Assist a Volunteer</u>	
	Richards v. Delbridge (1874), L.R. 18 Eq. 11.....	213
	Carson v. Wilson, [1961] O.R. 113 (C.A.).....	215
	Re Rose, [1952] Ch. 499.....	220
b.	<u>The Requirements for a Declaration of Trust</u>	
	Paul v. Constance, [1977] 1 All E.R. 195 (C.A.).....	228
	Re Vandervell's Trusts (No. 2), [1974] Ch. 269 (C.A.).....	231
c.	<u>Assigning an Equitable Interest</u>	
	Re Wale, [1956] 3 All E.R. 280 (Ch.).....	236
d.	<u>An Apparent Exception: The Rule in Strong v. Bird</u>	
	Re Freeland, [1952] 1 Ch. 110.....	244
	Re Gonin, [1977] 2 All E.R. 720 (Ch.).....	248

## CHAPTER 8 - FORMALITIES

a.	<u>Statutory Formalities</u>	
	<u>Statute of Frauds</u> , R.S.O. 1980, c. 481.....	253
	Note - Avoiding Statutory Formalities.....	253
b.	<u>Testamentary Formalities</u>	
	<u>Succession Law Reform Act</u> , R.S.O. 1980, c. 488.....	255
	Re Beardmore Trusts, [1952] 1 D.L.R. 41 (Ont. H.C.).....	257
	Re MacInnes, [1935] S.C.R. 200.....	257
	Anderson v. Patton, [1948] 1 D.L.R. 848 (Alta. S.C.); [1948] 2. D.L.R. 202 (C.A.).....	263

c. Secret Trusts

McCormick v. Grogan (1869), L.R. 4 H.L. 82.....	269
In Re Boyes (1884), 26 Ch. D. 531.....	276
Blackwell v. Blackwell, [1929] A.C. 318 (H.L.).....	279
In Re Keen, [1937] 1 Ch. 236 (C.A.).....	285
Ottaway v. Norman, [1972] Ch. 698.....	292
Re Mihalopolous (1956), 5 D.L.R. (2d) 628 (Alta. S.C.).....	299

## PART III

### CHARITIES

#### CHAPTER 9 - THE LEGAL MEANING OF CHARITY - RELIEF OF ROVERTY AND THE ADVANCEMENT OF RELIGION AND EDUCATION

##### a. Sources of Charity

<u>Statute of Charitable Uses</u> , 43 Eliz. 1, c. 4 (1601), preamble.....	305
<u>Morice v. The Bishop of Durham</u> (1804), 32 E.R. 656 (Ch.) 8.....	306
<u>Income Tax Commissioners v. Pemsel</u> , [1891] A.C. 531 (H.L.)...	307
<u>Re Laidlaw Foundation</u> (1984), 13 D.L.R. (4th) 491 (Ont. Div. Ct.).....	309

##### b. The Requirement of Exclusive Charitability

<u>Brewer v. McCauley</u> , [1954] S.C.R. 645.....	313
--	-----

##### c. The Relief of Poverty

<u>Re Scarisbrick</u> , [1951] Ch. 623 (C.A.).....	316
<u>Jones v. Executive Officers of the T. Eaton Co. Ltd.</u> , [1973] S.C.R. 635.....	323

##### d. The Advancement of Education

<u>Incorporated Council of Law Reporting for England and Wales v. Attorney General</u> , [1972] Ch. 73 (C.A.).....	328
<u>Re Pinion</u> , [1965] Ch. 85 (C.A.).....	335
<u>Oppenheim v. Tobacco Securities Trust Co. Ltd.</u> , [1951] A.C. 297 (H.L.).....	340

e. The Advancement of Religion

Thornton v. Howe (1862), 54 E.R. 1042.....	348
Barralet v. Attorney-General, [1980] 3 All E.R. 918.....	350
Gilmour v. Coats [1949] A.C. 426 (H.L.).....	354
Re Hetherington, [1989] 2 W.L.R. 1094 (Ch.).....	360

CHAPTER 10 - OTHER PURPOSES BENEFICIAL TO THE COMMUNITY AND THE PROBLEM OF POLITICAL PURPOSES

a. Other Purposes Beneficial to the Community

Re Laidlaw Foundation (1984), 13 D.L.R. (4th) 491 (Ont. Div. Ct.).....	365
Re Levy Estate (1989), 33 O.A.C. 99 (C.A.).....	373

b. The Political Purposes Doctrine

National Anti Vivisection Society v. Inland Revenue Commissioners, [1948] A.C. 31 (H.L.).....	378
McGovern v. Attorney General, [1982] 2 W.L.R. 222 (Ch.).....	391
Re Scarborough Community Legal Services and the Queen (1985), 17 D.L.R. (4th) 308 (Fed. C.A.).....	398
Re Positive Action Against Pornography and Minister of National Revenue (1988), 49 D.L.R. (4th) 74 (Fed. C.A.).....	403
<u>Globe and Mail</u> , 9 Nov. 1989 and 25 Jan. 1990.....	409

CHAPTER 11 - AVOIDING THE EXCLUSIVITY RULE

Note - Severance.....	411
Guaranty Trust Co. v. M.N.R., [1967] S.C.R. 133.....	411
Re Public Trustee and Toronto Humane Society (1987), 60 O.R. (2d) 236 (H.C.).....	422
Blais v. Touchet, [1963] S.C.R. 350.....	427

O.L.R.C., "Draft Trustee Act", s. 81.....	430
---	-----

## CHAPTER 12 - CY-PRES

### a. Impossibility or Impracticability

Rector, ect. of Parish of Christ Church v. Canada Permanent Trust Co. (1985), 18 E.T.R. 150 (N.S.S.C. - T.D.).....	432
Re Lysaght, [1966] 1 Ch. 191.....	436
Re Canada Trust Co. and the Ontario Human Rights Commission (1990).....	440

### b. General Charitable Intention

Re Wilson, [1913] 1 Ch. 314.....	440
Re Spence, [1979] Ch. 483.....	446
Re Fitzpatrick (1984), 16 E.T.R. 221 (Man. Q.B.).....	452
O.L.R.C., "Draft Trustee Act", ss. 75 & 76.....	459

